Pressures and Temperatures of Ultrahigh-Pressure Metamorphism: Implications for UHP Tectonics and H₂O **in Subducting Slabs**

B. R. HACKER¹

Department of Geological Sciences, Institute for Crustal Studies, University of California, Santa Barbara, California 93106-9630

Abstract

Kyanite–phengite eclogites can yield robust P–T equilibration conditions that do not depend on the ferrous/ferric ratios of the constituent minerals. Even rocks lacking kyanite *or* phengite—for which the ferrous/ferric ratios are calculated stoichiometrically—can yield equilibration conditions that differ by < 0.4 GPa. The range of robust P–T conditions for kyanite–phengite UHP eclogites is more restricted than that reported for eclogites generally, with most in the range 600–800°C and < 4 GPa; none fall in the "forbidden zone" defined by geothermal gradients of ≤ 5 K/km. Most UHP eclogites equilibrated at temperatures below the $H₂O$ -saturated solidus for crustal rocks. This is probably because hotter UHP terranes are sufficiently low in viscosity that they mix with their surroundings and lose their identity or re-equilibrate continuously during cooling until the solidus is reached. Lawsonite and chloritoid are not known from UHP eclogites.

Introduction

THE DEPTHS AND temperatures to which continental crust can be subducted and exhumed are important to quantify because knowledge of these conditions affects our understanding of: (1) whether subducting sediment or crust contributes a melt component to arc magmatism (Ringwood, 1974); (2) the temperatures in subduction zones (Kelemen et al., 2003); (3) the fluxes and mechanisms by which material is exchanged between the crust and mantle (Walsh and Hacker, 2004); (4) maximum depths of subduction/ exhumation; and (5) the degree of structural disruption of UHP terranes.

There have been many determinations of the equilibration conditions (temperature and depth) of UHP eclogites. The purpose of this paper is to: (1) assess whether those determinations are sufficiently accurate to answer the questions posed above; and (2) provide a reduced, but robust, data set of equilibration conditions for UHP eclogites.

The Problem

P–T determinations on UHP–HP eclogites are inherently difficult because most eclogites contain only two silicate phases: garnet and clinopyroxene. Measuring the Fe–Mg exchange between these two

minerals enables calculation of temperature, but additional phases such as phengite or kyanite are required for barometry. There are two problems, however, even with simple Fe-Mg exchange reactions that render temperature calculation via this method tenuous: (1) diffusional re-equilibration during retrogression ensures that recovering the peak temperature is unlikely—especially at the highest temperatures; and (2) the position of an Fe-Mg exchange reaction cannot be calculated accurately unless the Fe^{3+}/Fe^{2+} ratios of the Fe-bearing phases—particularly clinopyroxene—are known. The former problem is well known (Pattison et al., 2003), but the magnitude of the latter problem is perhaps not widely appreciated. Ravna and Paquin (2003) summarized the results of half a dozen studies that compared ferrous/ferric ratios calculated by charge balance with ratios measured by Mössbauer, micro-XANES, or titration. They found that Fe-Mg garnet-clinopyroxene temperatures calculated without knowledge of mineral Fe^{3+}/Fe^{2+} typically have uncertainties of ±100°C. Proyer et al*.* (2004) used the Mössbauer milliprobe to demonstrate that the problem can be even worse—with temperatures calculated assuming no ferric iron as much as 300°C too high. Unfortunately, there have only been a handful of Mössbauer, micro-XANES or titration $Fe³⁺/Fe²⁺ measurements on UHP eclipsites; these$ methods have not found general application. 1Email: hacker@geol.ucsb.edu

FIG. 1. P-T conditions of HP-UHP terranes. Solid lines show P-T for kyanite-phengite eclogites determined from intersections among garnet-clinopyroxene-muscovite-kyanite-quartz/coesite net-transfer equilibria and the solution models of Ravna and Terry (2004); the sizes and shapes of the uncertainty ellipses are from THERMOCALC and are represented at the ±0.25σ level for clarity. Using the solution models of THERMOCALC results in a similar, but slightly *continued on next page*

Fig. 1. *continued.* more dispersed set of pressures and temperatures. Dashed lines and italicized text show P-T determinations from other kinds of equilibria and reasoning (see text). Data from: a1 = Nowlan (1998), Dora Maira; a2 = Kienast et al. (1991), Dora Maira; a3 = Coggon and Holland (2002), Dora Maira; a4 = Hermann (2003); b1 = Massonne and O'Brien (2003), Saidenbach; b3 = Becker and Altherr (1992); d1 = Okay (1993), Dabie; d2 = Proyer et al. (2004), Dabie; d3 = Ravna and Terry (2004), using data from Carswell et al. (1997), Dabie; d4 = Zhang et al. (1995b), Dabie; d5 = Okay (1995), Dabie; d6 = Zhang and Liou (1994), Hong'an; d7 = Eide and Liou (2000), Hong'an; g1 = Gilotti and Ravna (2002), Greenland; k1 = Manning and Bohlen (1991), Kokchetav; k2 = Masago (2000), Kokchetav; n1 = Engvik et al. (2000), Norway; n2 = Ravna and Terry (2004), Norway; n3 = Terry et al. (2000), Norway; n4 = Wain (1998), Norway; n5 = Wain (1998), combined with an Fe³⁺ measurement by Catherine McCammon of a David Root sample from Norway; n6 = Young et al. (2006), Norway; n7 Krogh (1982), Norway; p1 = Hacker et al. (2005), Dunkeldik Pamir; s1 = Zhang et al. (1995a), Sulu; s2 = Mattinson et al. (2004), Sulu; s3 = Hirajima and Nakamura (2003), Sulu; sn1 = Baldwin et al. (2004), Snowbird tectonic zone.

A Solution

The best solution to both of these problems with eclogite thermobarometry is to use net-transfer equilibria, rather than exchange equilibria. The retrograde diffusional re-equilibration problem is solved (rather, reduced) because the increase in diffusive length scale from grain scale (in net-transfer reactions) to grain-boundary scale (in exchange reactions) vastly increases the ability to recover peak temperature, and the problem with ferrous/ferric ratios is solved by using equilibria that involve Mg rather than Fe. In eclogites, the equilibria of choice, as noted by Nakamura and Banno (1997) and Ravna and Terry (2004), are:

$$
1Mg_3Al_2Si_3O_{12} + 2Ca_3Al_2Si_3O_{12} +
$$
pyrope +
grossular +

$$
3KMgAISi4O10(OH)2 = 6CaMgSi2O6 +
$$
celadonite = diopside +

$$
3KAl2AlSi3O10(OH)2
$$

muscovite (1)

 $1\text{Mg}_3\text{Al}_2\text{Si}_3\text{O}_{12} + 1\text{Ca}_3\text{Al}_2\text{Si}_3\text{O}_{12} + 2\text{SiO}_2 =$ pyrope + grossular + coesite/quartz =

$$
2Al_2SiO_5 + 3CaMgSi_2O_6
$$
kyanite + diopside. (2)

Downloaded by [University of New Hampshire] at 21:51 04 December 2014 Downloaded by [University of New Hampshire] at 21:51 04 December 2014

TABLE 1. P-T Data for Kyanite ± Phengite Eclogites TABLE 1. P-T Data for Kyanite ± Phengite Eclogites

In other words, for kyanite–phengite eclogites in which all these phases are in equilibrium, the intersection between these reactions gives pressure and temperature without the need to measure Fe3+/Fe2+. Unfortunately, kyanite-phengite eclogites comprise only a small portion of the total eclogite population, gravely restricting the applicability of this method. This limitation is offset, however, by the huge advantage that the pressures and temperatures determined by this method are robust.

I applied this method to calculate accurate eclogite P–T conditions from microprobe mineral analyses presented in the literature (Fig. 1; Table 1). The positions of the net-transfer equilibria were calculated via two approaches: (1) using THERMOCALC v3.1 with the May 2001 database (Powell and Holland, 1988); and (2) using the spreadsheet of Ravna and Terry (2004), which is based on the same data set, but uses the Ganguly et al. (1996) garnet activity model rather than the Newton and Haselton (1981) model used by THERMOCALC. Only the P-T determination based on Ravna and Terry are shown in Figure 1; the P-T determinations based on THER-MOCALC are similar for samples with good fits among the relevant equilibria—on average 0.1 GPa lower (Fig. 2A) and 30°C cooler. In samples for which a range of mineral compositions was reported, I calculated P-T conditions using the most jadeite-rich omphacite, the most siliceous white mica, and the garnet with the highest $a_{\text{prp}}a_{\text{grs}}^2$, following the logic outlined by Carswell et al. (2000). Where possible, these data were supplemented with other robust T determinations (e.g., the oxygen isotope T measurements from Dora Maira by Sharp et al. (1993). A few UHP localities do not have kyanite–phengite eclogites. For these, I calculated or reported P–T (dashed lines in Fig. 1) using other equilibria.

Results

Western Gneiss Region, Norway

Ualculated conditions for equilibria among Mg-endmember gamet, clinopyroxene, kyanite, and quartz/coesite, using Thermocalc.
"Calculated conditions for equilibria among Mg-endmember gamet, clinopyroxene, hyanite, and quart

⁵Calculated conditions for equilibria among Mg-endmember gamet, climpyroxene, kyanite, and quartz/cossite, using Thermocalc.
"Thermocalc "mode 2" calculation using all equilibria among gamet, climpyroxene, kyanite, and q Calculated conditions for equilibria among Mg-endmember gamet, clinopyroxene, muscovite, kyanite, and quartz/coesite, using Thermocalc. Calculated conditions for equilibria among Mg-endmember garnet, clinopyroxene, kyanite, and quartz/coesite, using Thermocalc.

The Western Gneiss region of Norway contains one of the two giant UHP terranes on Earth. Mineral compositions in more than a dozen kyanite-phengite eclogites have been analyzed (Krogh, 1982; Carswell et al., 1997; Wain, 1998; Engvik et al., 2000; Terry et al., 2000; Young et al., 2006) and yield good intersections among the relevant equilibria (Fig. 1). The P-T conditions range from $\sim400^{\circ}$ C / 2.0 GPa to 800°C / 3.5 GPa, approximating a thermal gradient of \sim 7 K/km. No UHP melts or restites have been identified or postulated to exist.

Retrogression of the Western Gneiss region UHP rocks was near-isothermal to pressures of 0.5 GPa (Root et al., 2005). There is evidence of local melting after the UHP event. Widespread, minor amphibolite-facies melting of the gneiss hosting the UHP eclogites produced cm/dm-scale melt veins that locally coalesced into m-scale bodies (Labrousse et al., 2004). Strain shadows around some eclogite boudins are filled with pegmatitic trondhjemite that is spatially associated with amphibolitization of the eclogite, and interpreted to have been derived from the gneiss that hosts the eclogites (Cuthbert, 1995); some of these trondhjemites contain zircons that are significantly younger than zircon neoblasts within adjacent eclogite boudins (Krogh et al., 2004), supporting this interpretation.

NEGEP, Greenland

A few kyanite-phengite eclogites have been discovered and analyzed in the Northeast Greenland Eclogite Province (NEGEP) (Gilotti and Elvevold, 2002; Gilotti and KroghRavna, 2002). Two that yield good intersections among the relevant equilibria are shown in Figure 1.

Dabie-Sulu

The Dabie–Sulu region of China contains the second giant UHP terrane on Earth. More than a dozen kyanite–phengite eclogites have been analyzed (Okay, 1993, 1995; Zhang and Liou, 1994; Zhang et al., 1995a; Eide and Liou, 2000; Hirajima and Nakamura, 2003; Mattinson et al., 2004; Proyer et al., 2004) and some of these yield good intersections among the relevant equilibria (Fig. 1)—particularly those from Dabie. The P-T conditions range from \sim 450°C/2.0 GPa to 800°C/3.8 GPa, approximating a thermal gradient of ~6 K/km, a bit colder than Norway. No UHP melts or restites have been identified or postulated to exist.

Exhumation in Sulu involved near-isothermal decompression through 700–800°C and 0.7–1.2 GPa (Banno et al., 2000; Nakamura and Hirajima, 2000), whereas Dabie exhibits greater cooling during decompression (Zhang et al., 1995b). Anatectic textures and widespread, strongly deformed dikes that overlap in age with the UHP metamorphism imply melting during subduction in the Sulu area (Wallis et al., 2005).

Dora Maira

The Dora Maira locality in the Western Alps is one of two localities where coesite was first discovered (Chopin, 1984). The P-T determinations for Dora Maira shown in Figure 1 are calculations based on the data of Nowlan (1998) and Kienast et al. (1991), but also include the P–T determination of Coggon and Holland (2002), which makes use of an oxygen-isotope temperature determination by Sharp et al. (1993). The P-T conditions range from ~650 \degree C/2.5 GPa to 750 \degree C/3.2 GPa, approximating a thermal gradient of ~8 K/km, a bit warmer than Norway. Even higher pressures of 4.3 GPa in the diamond stability field have been suggested by Hermann (2003) for Dora Maira (dashed ellipse in Fig. 1), based on experiments in the KCMASH system, but diamond has not been found (Compagnoni and Rolfo, 2003).

A kyanite–garnet–phengite–quartz schist at Dora Maira has been considered by some (Schreyer et al., 1987; Sharp et al., 1993) to be a quenched melt produced from pyrope-coesite quartzite/whiteschist (Compagnoni and Rolfo, 2003). Evidence in favor of this melt hypothesis comes from Fe + Na rich almandine-jadeite-kyanite layers that have a bulk composition similar to granitic melt (Massonne and Schreyer, 1987). Late-stage enstatite + sapphirine assemblages developed in garnet cracks at low a_{H2O} , combined with continued stability of the peak-P assemblage talc + phengite indicate cooling during decompression (Simon and Chopin, 2001).

Kokchetav Massif, Kazakhstan

Regional metamorphic diamonds were first discovered on Earth in the Kokchetav Massif (Sobolev et al., 1990). Assessing P-T conditions of the diamond-facies metamorphism is difficult because the eclogites contain no kyanite and little phengite. The absence of kyanite means that P–T estimates can only involve phengite, clinopyroxene, and garnet, and therefore suffer from the problems with Fe-Mg exchange outlined earlier. The estimated eclogite equilibration conditions fall below the diamond stability field ("k2" in Fig. 1), which led Masago (2000) to conclude that the eclogites were mixed into a higher-pressure host paragneiss, but the pressures differ from the diamond stability field by only a few kbar and can as easily be attributed to inaccuracy in barometry. Much higher pressures up to 5–8 GPa—have been estimated from the presence of supersilicic titanite (Ogasawara et al., 2002), the amount of $K₂O$ in clinopyroxene

FIG. 2. Comparison of pressures at intersection temperature calculated (A) using THERMOCALC vs. Ravna and Terry (2004) for the assemblage garnet-kyanite-clinopyroxenephengite-quartz/coesite; (B) using Ravna and Terry (2004) vs. the assemblage garnet–clinopyroxene–phengite–quartz/coesite with THERMOCALC; (C) using Ravna and Terry (2004) vs. the assemblage garnet-clinopyroxene-kyanite-quartz/coesite with THERMOCALC. Uncertainties for the Ravna and Terry (2004) pressure and temperature assumed equal to that for THERMOCALC.

(Katayama et al., 2002; Bindi et al., 2003), and rutile–titanite barometry ("k1" in Fig. 1; Manning and Bohlen, 1991). There are reasons for considering each of these claims with caution—large extrapolation of experimental solubility data in the case of the first two, and considerable extrapolation of the thermodynamic properties of the phases in the case of the latter. Temperatures in excess of 1000°C have been estimated from Ti solubilities in garnet (Massonne, 2003).

The prograde and retrograde path are reasonably well constrained through amphibolite- and greenschist-facies conditions by Zhang et al. (1997), Masago (2000), and Parkinson (2000). Massonne (2003) suggested that garnet-muscovite gneisses that host the eclogites formed by the melting of metasediments at high pressure. No melting of the host gneisses during decompression has been detected.

Bohemian Massif

The Bohemian Massif is a Variscan basement uplift centered around Prague, long known to contain high-pressure granulites (O'Brien and Carswell, 1993). In recent years, diamond (Massonne, 1998) and then coesite (Massonne, 2001) have been found. A range of P–T conditions is expected for the Bohemian Massif simply because of the large number of nappes. For the Münchberg Massif I calculate 660– 725°C/2.8 GPa using the data of Klemd et al. (1991) and O'Brien (1993) reported by Massonne and O'Brien (2003). For the Gföhl unit, Becker and Altherr (1992) estimated ~1100°C and >3 GPa for a marble containing clinopyroxene with K-feldspar exsolution lamellae; our recalculations using Fe–Mg exchange between garnet and clinopyroxene (Ravna and Terry, 2004) indicate cooler temperatures of 950–1000°C at an assumed pressure of 3–4 GPa for this same rock. For the Erzgebirge Massif, Massonne and O'Brien (2003) suggested P–T conditions of 1000°C at 4.5 GPa using the solubility of Ti in

garnet. The concentration of Zr in rutile suggests 900–1000°C (Zack et al., 2005) for the same rocks, and I calculate 1040°C and 4.1 GPa by applying garnet-clinopyroxene-phengite-coesite equilibria to the data of Massonne and O'Brien (2003). The discovery of nanometer-size α -PbO₂–structured TiO₂ in the Erzgebirge by Hwang et al*.* (2000) prompted suggestions of recrystallization at 7 GPa (Massonne, 2003), but Hwang et al. emphasized that the unknown effect of interfacial free energies on the stability of α -PbO₂–structured TiO₂ makes pressures of ~4 GPa more likely.

A number of localities within the Bohemian Massif have been interpreted to contain quenched high-pressure melts: Gföhl nappe metasedimentary rocks (Vrána, 1989; Kotková and Harley, 1999), north Moldanubian leucogranulites (Kotková and Harley, 1999), very potassium-feldspar rich garnetbearing layers within a garnet-kyanite-biotite granulite in the Blansky les Massif (Vrána, 1989), and garnet-muscovite gneisses at Erzgebirge (Massonne, 2001, 2003).

The Bohemian Massif underwent cooling during decompression, showing granulite- and amphibolite-facies overprints from 800°C down to 500°C (O'Brien and Carswell, 1993; Massonne and O'Brien, 2003). Local melting, producing zoisitebearing leucotonalites, occurred during decompression from ~2 to 1 GPa, prior to an amphibolite-facies overprint (Franz and Smelik 1995).

Snowbird tectonic zone

Garnet-kyanite gneiss in the Snowbird tectonic zone in Canada equilibrated under near-UHP conditions. Using mineral compositions from Baldwin et al*.* (2004) and garnet-clinopyroxene-kyanite-quartz equilibria, I calculated P-T conditions of 880°C/2.7 GPa for these rocks. Retrogression occurred at 900°C /1.6 GPa and 800°C/0.9 GPa (Baldwin et al., 2003). These rocks represent subducted or otherwise deeply buried continental crust.

Xenoliths from Dunkeldik, Pamir

Xenoliths erupted in Miocene ultrapotassic igneous rocks in the Southern Pamir also came from near-UHP conditions (Ducea et al., 2003; Hacker et al., 2005). Solid-phase thermobarometry (garnetclinopyroxene ± kyanite ± quartz; Hacker et al., 2005), reveals recrystallization at temperatures of 1000–1100°C and pressures of 2.5–2.8 GPa. Textures, parageneses, mineral compositions, and Nd and O isotopic ratios indicate derivation of the xenoliths from subducted basaltic, tonalitic, and pelitic crust that experienced high-pressure dehydration melting, K-rich metasomatism, and solid-state re-equilibration.

Implications for UHP Metamorphism

Figure 3 is a synopsis of the data in Figure 1 and therefore represents a worldwide compendium of the P-T conditions of HP-UHP eclogites with kyanite + phengite, plus a few particularly noteworthy eclogite localities that lack one or both of these phases. Also shown are the range of H_2O -saturated solidi for crustal rocks (including granite, tonalite, basalt and sediment), the range of phengite-dehydration solidi, and the range of P-T conditions reported in the literature using *all* kinds of thermobarometry.

A number of important observations fall from this figure. As determined by the technique employed in this study, the temperature range of *UHP kyanitephengite* eclogites is ~ 550 to ~ 850 °C, although most are 600–800°C; the maximum pressure is <4 GPa. This P-T field is smaller than that determined for kyanite- or phengite-free eclogites (hachured region), which suffer from the various disadvantages outlined earlier. None of the robust P-T determinations fall on the high P/T side of the "forbidden zone" at a P-T trajectory of 5 K/km (Liou et al., 2000), suggesting that no eclogites can yet be proven to have experienced such conditions. Most of the robust P–T determinations fall at temperatures below the $H₂O$ -saturated solidi for crustal rocks, and, indeed, the majority of the robust P-T determinations cluster *along* the solidi. The only phengite– kyanite eclogites in Figure 2 that reveal equilibration conditions above the solidus are from Greenland, suggesting that those rocks are unique. This coincidence between eclogite P-T conditions and the crustal solidus likely reflects a geologic process. It may indicate that: (1) UHP rocks that experience hypersolidus temperatures recrystallize continuously in the presence of melt during cooling and then "freeze in" mineral compositions when they cross back below the solidus; (2) UHP rocks that experience hypersolidus temperatures are rarely exhumed because the UHP terrane disaggregates as a result of melt-induced weakening; or (3) UHP rocks rarely experience hypersolidus temperatures. Although the latter possibility is improbable, either of the first two are permissible.

There are, of course, a few HP-UHP occurrences—specifically Kokchetav, the Bohemian

FIG. 3. Synoptic diagram of P-T conditions for HP-UHP eclogites. Range of solidi shown for H2O-saturated granite (Stern et al., 1975), tonalite (Stern et al., 1975), sediment (Nichols et al., 1994), MORB (Kessel et al., 2005), and phengite dehydration (Hermann and Green, 2001).

Massif, the Snowbird tectonic zone, and the Dunkeldik Pamir xenoliths—for which much higher temperatures or pressures have been calculated. Most of these localities lack phengite and cannot, therefore, yield "robust" (in the sense of this paper) P-T determinations from kyanite-phengite-clinopyroxene-garnet equilibria. The main issue is the ferrous/ferric ratio in clinopyroxene—if there is significant Ca-Eskola component $(CA_{0.5}AISi_2O_6)$ in

the clinopyroxene, the calculated Fe3+, and thus temperature, will be underestimated (E. Ravna, pers. commun., 2006). Until better or new solution models can be determined, many of these P-T determinations will remain somewhat speculative. Perhaps the only exception to this is the Pamir rocks, which, because they are xenoliths, suffer from none of the retrogression issues that plague HP– UHP terranes.

Implications for UHP Hydrous Phases

Considerable effort has been spent to assess the conditions under which oceanic lithosphere dehydrates during subduction. Experimental and theoretical studies (e.g., Connolly and Kerrick, 2002; Schmidt and Poli, 2003) suggest that lawsonite and chloritoid are stable at UHP conditions. However, no UHP rocks have been found that contain either chloritoid or lawsonite, and all known lawsonite eclogites were stable at non-UHP conditions (Altherr et al., 2004; Zack et al., 2004b; Tsujimori et al., 2005). These observations imply that chloritoid and lawsonite are not stable at UHP conditions. The only significant hydrous phase in UHP eclogite is phengite, which is typically present at 0–5 vol%, implying crystallographically bound $H₂O$ contents of ≤ 0.25 wt%.

Implications for UHP Thermobarometry

Despite the concerns presented in the introduction to this paper, reasonably accurate pressures can be obtained from phengite eclogites. Figure 2B shows that the pressure determined by THERMO-CALC from the intersection of the garnet–clinopyroxene thermometer (dependent on Fe^{2+}/Fe^{3+}) with reaction 1 (i.e., a kyanite-free eclogite) deviating from the intersection of reactions 1 and 2 (independent on Fe2+/Fe3+) determined using Ravna and Terry (2004) by $\lt 0.2$ GPa over the pressure range of interest. The situation is not as good for kyanite eclogites. Figure 2E shows that the pressure determined by THERMOCALC from the intersection of the garnet–clinopyroxene thermometer (dependent on $Fe²⁺/Fe³⁺$) with reaction 2 (i.e., a phengite-free eclogite) is as much as ~ 0.4 GPa lower than the intersection of reactions 1 and 2 from Ravna and Terry (2004) (independent of Fe^{2+}/Fe^{3+}) in the 2-4 GPa range.

Future Work

Four new trace-element thermometers—Ti in zircon, Zr in rutile, Ti in quartz, and Zr in garnet enable major advances in our ability to recover peak temperatures in metamorphic rocks. These thermometers are imperfectly calibrated, but may be useful for eclogites because of the relatively low diffusivities of high-valence cations. Thus, where Fe-Mg exchange during cooling may have continued to 800°C or lower in many eclogites, the Ti and Zr thermometers could still record higher temperatures. The requisite saturating phases—rutile, zircon, and/or quartz—are common in eclogites.

The Ti-in-zircon thermometer (Watson and Harrison, 2005) is experimentally and empirically calibrated. The effect of pressure has not been quantified, but appears to be small over the 0.2–2.0 GPa range of the calibration. Whether zircons are igneous or metamorphic can be assessed qualitatively with cathodoluminescence (metamorphic zircons in HP rocks tend to have mottled or patchy cathodoluminescence, rather different from igneous grains; Corfu et al., 2003; Root, 2003) and through measured REE and Th/U (Rubatto, 2002; Root et al., 2004).

The Ti-in-quartz thermometer, published in abstract form (Wark and Watson, 2004), is experimentally calibrated at 1 GPa. The effect of pressure has not been assessed, and the solubility of Ti in coesite has not been measured. Moreover, the effect of the coesite \rightarrow quartz reaction on Ti zoning is unknown; despite the polymorphic nature of these minerals, transformation textures indicate that quartz nucleates on coesite grain boundaries and grows via grain-boundary propagation (Hacker and Peacock, 1995), a process likely to modify the Ti zoning of the precursor coesite.

Zr-in-rutile (Zack et al., 2004a, 2005) is empirically calibrated and, as a result, less precise $(\pm 50 -$ 100°C). No pressure effect was quantified by Zack et al. All natural rutiles I have examined in UHP rocks contain plates of ilmenite, but Zack et al. (2004a) did not report this to be a problem.

Zr-in-garnet (Donohue et al., 2001) is experimentally calibrated in almandine only, as reported in a Ph.D. thesis (Donohue, 2002). The effect of pressure on Zr solubility in garnet is substantial, such that at 2 GPa, the Zr solubility does not reach 100 ppm until 1100°C. In summary, these thermometers are preliminary, but given the paucity of other thermometers available in eclogites, they should be exploited.

Conclusions

Robust P-T determinations can be obtained from kyanite-phengite eclogites; surprisingly, even if kyanite or phengite are absent, the calculated equilibration conditions differ from the "robust" answer by <0.4 GPa. Most UHP terranes equilibrated at 600–800°C and < 4 GPa, along metamorphic field gradients of 6–8 K/km; none fall within the very low T/P "forbidden zone." Most of their eclogites record P-T conditions below the $H₂O$ -saturated solidus for crustal rocks, presumably because hotter UHP terranes disaggregate or undergo continuous re-equilibration during cooling; the few unusually hot UHP terranes deserve further study. By its very nature, this review has excluded a range of more speculative thermobarometric studies, which, if proven correct, will modify these conclusions.

Acknowledgments

It is a pleasure to dedicate this paper to J. G. "Louie" Liou, one of the great UHP petrologists. My career was indelibly stamped by Louie, who, among many other unselfish acts on my behalf, shared his Stanford office with me following the 1989 Loma Prieta earthquake and was responsible for getting me involved in UHP research in China. To him, a salute of gratitude and respect. Erling Ravna and Mike Terry graciously provided constructive reviews.

REFERENCES

- Altherr, R., Topuz, G., Marschall, H., Zack, T., and Ludwig, T., 2004, Evolution of a tourmaline-bearing lawsonite eclogite from the Elekdag area (central Pontides, N Turkey): Evidence for infiltration of slabderived B-rich fluids during exhumation: Contributions to Mineralogy and Petrology, v. 148, p. 409–425.
- Baldwin, J. A., Bowring, S. A., and Williams, M. L., 2003, Petrological and geochronological constraints on high pressure, high temperature metamorphism in the Snowbird tectonic zone, Canada: Journal of Metamorphic Geology, v. 21, p. 81–98.
- Baldwin, J. A., Bowring, S. A., Williams, M. L., and Williams, I. S., 2004, Eclogites of the Snowbird tectonic zone: Petrological and U-Pb geochronological evidence for Paleoproterozoic high-pressure metamorphism in the western Canadian Shield: Contributions to Mineralogy and Petrology, v. 147, p. 528–548.
- Banno, S., Enami, M., Hirajima, T., Ishiwatari, A., and Wang, Q., 2000, Decompression P-T path of coesite eclogite to granulite from Weihai, eastern China: Lithos, v. 52, p. 97–108.
- Becker, H., and Altherr, R., 1992, Evidence from ultrahigh pressure marbles for recycling of sediments into the mantle: Nature, v. 358, p. 745–748.
- Bindi, L., Safonov, O. G., Yapaskurt, V. O., Perchuk, L. L., and Menchetti, S., 2003, Ultrapotassic clinopyroxene from the Kumdy-Kol microdiamond mine, Kokchetav Complex, Kazakhstan: Occurrence, composition and

crystal-chemical characterization: American Mineralogist, v. 88, p. 464–468.

- Carswell, D. A., O'Brien, P. J., Wilson, R. N., and Zhai, M., 1997, Thermobarometry of phengite-bearing eclogites in the Dabie Mountains of central China: Journal of Metamorphic Geology, v. 15, p. 239–252.
- Carswell, D. A., Wilson, R. N., and Zhai, M., 2000, Metamorphic evolution, mineral chemistry and thermobarometry of schists and orthogneisses hosting ultrahigh pressure eclogites in the Dabieshan of central China: Lithos, v. 52, p. 121–155.
- Chopin, C., 1984, Coesite and pure pyrope in high-grade blueschists of the western Alps: a first record and some consequences: Contributions to Mineralogy and Petrology, v. 86, p. 107–118.
- Coggon, R., and Holland, T. J. B., 2002, Mixing properties of phengitic micas and revised garnet-phengite thermobarometers: Journal of Metamorphic Geology, v. 20, p. 683–696.
- Compagnoni, R., and Rolfo, F., 2003, UHPM units in the Western Alps: EMU Notes in Mineralogy, v. 5, p. 13– 49.
- Connolly, J. A. D., and Kerrick, D. M., 2002, Metamorphic controls on seismic velocity of subducted oceanic crust at 100-250 km depth: Earth and Planetary Science Letters, v. 204, p. 61–74.
- Corfu, F., Hanchar, J. M., Hoskin, P. W. O., and Kinny, P. D., 2003, Atlas of zircon textures: Reviews in Mineralogy and Geochemistry, v. 53, p. 469–500.
- Cuthbert, S., 1995, Trondhjemite veins in eclogite from the Western Gneiss region, Norwegian Caledonides: Evidence for partial melting: Chinese Science Bulletin, v. 40, p. 103–104.
- Donohue, C. L., 2002, Late Archean metamorphic history of the Wind River Range, Wyoming: Unpubl. Ph.D. dissertation, University of Michigan, 228 p.
- Donohue, C. L., Manning, C. E., and Essene, E. J., 2001, The Pressure and Temperature Dependence of Zr And Ti Substitution in almandine [abs.]: Geological Society of America Abstracts with Programs, paper 105-0.
- Ducea, M. N., Lutkov, V., Minaev, V. T., Hacker, B., Ratschbacher, L., Luffi, P., Schwab, M., Gehrels, G. E., McWilliams, M., Vervoort, J., and Metcalf, J., 2003, Building the Pamirs: The view from the underside: Geology, v. 31, p. 849–852.
- Düffels, K., and Massonne, H. J., 2001, Geochemical signatures of diamondiferous gneisses and their adjacent rocks from the Erzgebirge, Germany: Terra Nostra, v. 5, p. 24–26.
- Eide, E. A., and Liou, J. G., 2000, High-pressure blueschists and eclogites in Hong'an: A framework for addressing the evolution of ultrahigh-pressure rocks in central China: Lithos, v. 52, p. 1–22.
- Engvik, A. K., Austrheim, H., and Andersen, T. B., 2000, Structural, mineralogical and petrophysical effects on deep crustal rocks of fluid-limited polymetamorphism,

Western Gneiss Region, Norway: Journal of the Geological Society of London, v. 157, p. 121–134.

- Franz, G., and Smelik, E. A., 1995, Zoisite-clinozoisite bearing pegmatites and their importance for decompressional melting in eclogites: European Journal of Mineralogy, v. 7, p. 1421–1436.
- Ganguly, J., Cheng, W., and Tirone, M., 1996, Thermodynamics of aluminosilicate garnet solid solution: new experimental data, and optimized model, and thermometric applications: Contributions to Mineralogy and Petrology, v. 126, p. 137–151.
- Gilotti, J. A., and Elvevold, S., 2002, Extensional exhumation of a high-pressure granulite terrane in Payer Land, Greenland Caledonides: Structural, petrologic, and geochronologic evidence from metapelites: Canadian Journal of Earth Sciences/Revue Canadienne des Sciences de la Terre, v. 39, p. 1169–1187.
- Gilotti, J. A., and Krogh Ravna, E., 2002, First evidence of ultrahigh-pressure metamorphism in the North-East Greenland Caledonides: Geology, v. 30, p. 551–554.
- Hacker, B. R., Luffi, P., Lutkov, V., Minaev, V. T., Ratschbacher, L. R., Patino-Douce, A. E., Ducea, M. N., McWilliams, M. O., and Metcalf, J., 2005, Near-ultrahigh pressure processing of continental crust: Miocene crustal xenoliths from the Pamir: Journal of Petrology, v. 46, p. 1661–1687.
- Hacker, B. R., and Peacock, S. M., 1995, Creation, preservation, and exhumation of coesite-bearing, ultrahighpressure metamorphic rocks, *in* Coleman, R. G., and Wang, X., eds., Ultrahigh pressure metamorphism: Cambridge, UK, Cambridge University Press, p. 159– 181.
- Hermann, J., 2003, Experimental evidence for diamondfacies metamorphism in the Dora-Maira massif: Lithos, v. 70, p. 163–182.
- Hermann, J., and Green, D. H., 2001, Experimental constraints on high pressure melting in subducted crust: Earth and Planetary Science Letters, v. 188, p. 149– 168.
- Hirajima, T., and Nakamura, D., 2003, The Dabie Shan– Sulu orogen: EMU Notes in Mineralogy, v. 5, p. 105– 144.
- Hwang, S. L., Shen, P., Chu, H. T., and Yui, T. F., 2000, Nanometer-size α -PbO₂-type TiO₂ in garnet: A thermobarometer for ultrahigh-pressure metamorphism: Science, v. 288, p. 321–324.
- Katayama, I., Ohta, M., and Ogasawara, Y., 2002, Mineral inclusions in zircon from diamond-bearing marble in the Kokchetav massif, northern Kazakhstan: European Journal of Mineralogy, v. 14, p. 1103–1108.
- Kelemen, P. B., Parmentier, E. M., Rilling, J., Mehl, L., and Hacker, B. R., 2003, Thermal structure due to solid-state flow in the mantle wedge beneath arcs: American Geophysical Union Monograph, v. 138, p. 293–311.
- Kessel, R., Ulmer, P., Pettke, T., Schmidt, M. W., and Thompson, A. B., 2005, The water–basalt system at 4

to 6 GPa: Phase relations and second critical endpoint in a K-free eclogite at 700 to 1400°C: Earth and Planetary Science Letters, v. 237, p. 873–892.

- Kienast, J. R., Lombardo, B., Biino, G., and Pinardon, J. L., 1991, Petrology of very-high-pressure eclogitic rocks from the Brossasco-Isasca Complex, Dora-Maira Massif, Italian Western Alps: Journal of Metamorphic Geology, v. 9, p. 19–34.
- Klemd, R., Mattes, S., and Okrusch, M., 1991, High-pressure relics in meta-sediments intercalated with the Weissenstein eclogite, Münchberg gneiss complex, Bavaria: Contributions to Mineralogy and Petrology, v. 107, p. 328–342.
- Kotková, J., and Harley, S. L., 1999, Formation and evolution of high-pressure leucogranulites: Experimental constraints and unresolved issues: Physics and Chemistry of the Earth, v. 24, p. 299–304.
- Krogh, E. J., 1982, Metamorphic evolution of Norwegian country-rock eclogites, as deduced from mineral inclusions and compositional zoning in garnets: Lithos, v. 15, p. 305–321.
- Krogh, T., Kwok, Y., Robinson, P., and Terry, M. P., 2004, U-Pb constraints on the subduction-extension interval in the Averøya-Nordøyane area, Western Gneiss Region, Norway [abs.], Goldschmidt Conference abstract: Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta, v. 68, p. A61.
- Krogh Ravna, E., and Paquin, J., 2003, Thermobarometric methodologies applicable to eclogites and garnet ultrabasites: EMU Notes in Mineralogy, v. 5, p. 229–259.
- Labrousse, L., Jolivet, L., Andersen, T. B., Agard, P., Maluski, H., and Schärer, U., 2004, Pressure-temperature-time-deformation history of the exhumation of ultra-high pressure rocks in the Western Gneiss region, Norway: Geological Society of America Special Paper, v. 380, p. 155–185.
- Liou, J. G., Hacker, B. R., and Zhang, R. Y., 2000, Ultrahigh-pressure (UHP) metamorphism in the forbidden zone: Science, v. 287, p. 1215–1216.
- Manning, C. E., and Bohlen, S. R., 1991, The reaction titanite + kyanite = anorthite + rutile and titaniterutile barometry in eclogites: Contributions to Mineralogy and Petrology, v. 109, p. 1–9.
- Masago, H., 2000, Metamorphic petrology of the Barchi-Kol metabasites, western Kokchetav ultrahigh-pressure–high-pressure massif, northern Kazakhstan: The Island Arc, v. 9, p. 358–378.
- Massonne, H.-J., 1998, A new occurrence of microdiamonds in quartzofeldspathic rocks of the Saxonian Erzgebirge, Germany, and their metamorphic evolution: Proceedings of the VII International Kimberlite Conference, v. 2, p. 533–539.
- Massonne, H.-J., 2001, First find of coesite in the ultrahigh-pressure metamorphic area of the central Erzgebirge, Germany: European Journal of Mineralogy, v. 13, p. 565–570.
- Massonne, H.-J., 2003, A comparison of the evolution of diamondiferous quartz-rich rocks from the Saxonian Erzgebirge and the Kokchetav Massif: Are so-called diamondiferous gneisses magmatic rocks?: Earth and Planetary Science Letters, v. 216, p. 347–364.
- Massonne, H. J., and O'Brien, P. J., 2003, The Bohemian Massif and the NW Himalaya: EMU Notes in Mineralogy, v. 5, p. 145–187.
- Massonne, H. J., and Schreyer, W., 1987, Phengite barometry based on the limiting assemblage with K-feldspar, phlogopite, and quartz: Contributions to Mineralogy and Petrology, v. 96, p. 212–224.
- Mattinson, C. G., Zhang, R. Y., Tsujimori, T., and Liou, J. G., 2004, Epidote-rich talc-kyanite-phengite eclogites, Sulu terrane, eastern China: $P-T-fO₂$ estimates and the significance of the epidote-talc assemblage in eclogite: American Mineralogist, v. 89, p. 1772–1783.
- Nakamura, D., and Banno, S., 1997, Thermodynamic modeling of sodic pyroxene solid-solution and its application in a garnet–omphacite–kyanite–coesite geothermobarometer for UHP metamorphic rocks: Contributions to Mineralogy and Petrology, v. 130, p. 93–102.
- Nakamura, D., and Hirajima, T., 2000, Granulite-facies overprinting of ultrahigh-pressure metamorphic rocks, northeastern Sulu region, eastern China: Journal of Petrology, v. 41, p. 563–582.
- Newton, R. C., and Haselton, H. T., 1981, Thermodynamics of the garnet-plagioclase- Al_2SiO_5 -quartz geobarometer, *in* Newton, R. C., ed., Thermodynamics of minerals and melts: New York, NY, Springer-Verlag, p. 131–147.
- Nichols, G. T., Wyllie, P. J., and Stern, C. R., 1994, Subduction zone melting of pelagic sediments constrained by melting experiments: Nature, v. 371, p. 785–788.
- Nowlan, E. U., 1998, Druck-Temperatur-Entwicklung und Geochemie von Eklogiten des Dora-Maira-Massivs, Westalpen: Unpubl. Ph.D. thesis, Bochum University, 359 p.
- O'Brien, P. J., 1993, Partially retrograded eclogites of the Muenchberg Massif, Germany: Records of a multistage Variscan uplift history in the Bohemian Massif: Journal of Metamorphic Geology, v. 11, p. 241–260.
- O'Brien, P. J., and Carswell, D. A., 1993, Tectonometamorphic evolution of the Bohemian Massif: Evidence from high-pressure metamorphic rocks: Geologische Rundschau, v. 82, p. 531–555.
- Ogasawara, Y., Fukasawa, K., and Maruyama, S., 2002, Coesite exsolution from supersilicic titanite in UHP marble from the Kokchetav Massif, northern Kazakhstan: American Mineralogist, v. 87, p. 454–461.
- Okay, A. I., 1993, Petrology of a diamond and coesitebearing metamorphic terrain: Dabie Shan, China: European Journal of Mineralogy, v. 5, p. 659–675.
- Okay, A. I., 1995, Paragonite eclogites from Dabie Shan, China: Re-equilibration during exhumation?: Journal of Metamorphic Geology, v. 13, p. 449–460.
- Parkinson, C. D., 2000, Coesite inclusions and prograde compositional zonation of garnet in whiteschist of the HP-UHPM Kokchetav massif, Kazakhstan: A record of progressive UHP metamorphism: Lithos, v. 52, p. 215– 233.
- Pattison, D. R. M., Chacko, T., Farquhar, J., and McFarlane, C. R. M., 2003, Temperatures of granulite-facies metamorphism: Constraints from experimental phase equilibria and thermobarometry corrected for retrograde exchange: Journal of Petrology, v. 44, p. 867– 900.
- Powell, R., and Holland, T. J. B., 1988, An internally consistent dataset with uncertainties and correlations: 3. Applications to geobarometry, worked examples and a computer program: Journal of Metamorphic Geology, v. 6, p. 173–204.
- Proyer, A., Dachs, E., and McCammon, C., 2004, Pitfalls in geothermobarometry of eclogites: Fe3+ and changes in the mineral chemistry of omphacite at ultrahigh pressures: Contributions to Mineralogy and Petrology, v. 147, p. 305–318.
- Ravna, E. J. K., 2003, Thermobarometric methodologies applicable to eclogites and garnet ultrabasites: EMU Notes in Mineralogy, v. 5, p. 229–259.
- Ravna, E. J. K., and Terry, M. P., 2004, Geothermobarometry of phengite-kyanite-quartz/coesite eclogites: Journal of Metamorphic Geology, v. 22, p. 579–592.
- Ringwood, A. E., 1974, The petrological evolution of island arc systems: Journal of the Geological Society of London, v. 130, p. 183–204.
- Root, D. B., 2003, Zircon geochronology of ultrahigh-pressure eclogites and exhumation of the Western Gneiss Region, southern Norway: Unpubl. Ph.D. dissertation, University of California, 87 p.
- Root, D. B., Hacker, B. R., Gans, P., Eide, E., Ducea, M., and Mosenfelder, J., 2005, High-pressure allochthons overlie the ultrahigh-pressure Western Gneiss Region, Norway: Journal of Metamorphic Geology, v. 23, p. 45– 61.
- Root, D. B., Hacker, B. R., Mattinson, J. M., and Wooden, J. L., 2004, Young age and rapid exhumation of Norwegian ultrahigh-pressure rocks: An ion microprobe and chemical abrasion study: Earth and Planetary Science Letters, v. 228, p. 325–341.
- Rubatto, D., 2002, Zircon trace element geochemistry: Partitioning with garnet and the link between U-Pb ages and metamorphism: Chemical Geology, v. 184, p. 123–138.
- Schmidt, M. W., and Poli, S., 2003, Generation of mobile components during subduction of oceanic crust, *in* Rudnick, R., ed., Treatise on geochemistry, v. 3. The Crust: Amsterdam, The Netherlands, Elsevier, p. 567– 591.
- Schreyer, W., Massonne, H. J., and Chopin, C., 1987, Continental crust subducted to depths near 100 km: Implications for magma and fluid genesis in collision zones, *in* Mysen, B. O., ed., Magmatic processes: Physiochemical Principles: University Park, PA, Geochemical Society, p. 155–163.
- Sharp, Z. D., Essene, E. J., and Hunziker, J. C., 1993, Stable isotope geochemistry and phase equilibria of coesite-bearing whiteschists, Dora Maira Massif, western Alps: Contributions to Mineralogy and Petrology, v. 114, p. 1–12.
- Simon, G., and Chopin, C., 2001, Enstatite-sapphirine crack-related assemblages in ultrahigh-pressure pyrope megablasts, Dora-Maira massif, western Alps: Contributions to Mineralogy and Petrology, v. 140, p. 422–440.
- Sobolev, N. V., Shatsky, V. S., and Shatskiy, V. S., 1990, Diamond inclusions in garnets from metamorphic rocks; a new environment for diamond formation: Nature, v. 343, p. 742–746.
- Stern, C. R., Huang, W. L., and Wyllie, P. J., 1975, Basaltandesite-rhyolite-H₂O: Crystallization intervals with excess H_2O and H_2O -undersaturated liquidus surfaces to 35 kilobars, with implications for magma genesis: Earth and Planetary Science Letters, v. 28, p. 189– 196.
- Terry, M. P., Robinson, P., and Ravna, E. J. K., 2000, Kyanite eclogite thermobarometry and evidence for thrusting of UHP over HP metamorphic rocks, Nordøyane, Western Gneiss Region, Norway: American Mineralogist, v. 85, p. 1637–1650.
- Tsujimori, T., Liou, J. G., Coleman, R. G., Sorensen, S. S., and Carlson, W., 2005, Coexisting retrograde jadeite and omphacite in a jadeite-bearing lawsonite eclogite from the Motagua fault zone, Guatemala: American Mineralogist, v. 90, p. 836–842.
- Vrána, S., 1989, Perpotassic granulites from southern Bohemia. A new rock-type derived from partial melting of crustal rocks under upper mantle conditions: Contributions to Mineralogy and Petrology, v. 103, p. 510–522.
- Wain, A. L., 1998, Ultrahigh-pressure metamorphism in the Western Gneiss Region of Norway: Unpubl. Ph.D. thesis, Oxford University, Oxford, UK.
- Wallis, S., Tsuboi, M., Suzuki, K., Laili, J., and Tanaka, T., 2005, Role of partial melting in the evolution of the Sulu UHP terrane: Geology, v. 33, p. 129–132.
- Walsh, E. O., and Hacker, B. R., 2004, The fate of subducted continental margins: Two-stage exhumation of the high-pressure to ultrahigh-pressure Western Gneiss complex, Norway: Journal of Metamorphic Geology, v. 22, p. 671–689.
- Wark, D. A., and Watson, E. B., 2004, A titanium-inquartz thermometer [abs.], Goldschmidt Conference abstract: Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta, v. 68, p. A543.
- Watson, E. B., and Harrison, T. M., 2005, Zircon thermometer reveals minimum melting conditions on earliest Earth: Science, v. 308, p. 841–844.
- Young, D. J., Hacker, B. R., Andersen, T. B., Corfu, F., Gehrels, G. E., and Grove, M., 2006, Amphibolite to ultrahigh-pressure transition in western Norway: Implications for exhumation tectonics: Tectonics, in press.
- Zack, T., Moraes, R., and Kronz, A., 2004a, Temperature dependence of Zr in rutile: Empirical calibration of a rutile thermometer: Contributions to Mineralogy and Petrology, v. 148, p. 471–488.
- Zack, T., Moraes, R., and Luvizotto, G. L., 2005, Rutile thermometry: State of the art and outlook: Mitteilungen der Österreichischen Mineralogischen Gesellschaft, v. 150, p. 170.
- Zack, T., Rivers, T., Brumm, R., and Kronz, A., 2004b, Cold subduction of oceanic crust: Implications for a lawsonite eclogite from the Dominican Republic: European Journal of Mineralogy, v. 16, p. 909–916.
- Zhang, R., Hirajima, T., Banno, S., Cong, B., and Liou, J. G., 1995a, Petrology of ultrahigh-pressure rocks from the southern Su-Lu region, eastern China: Journal of Metamorphic Geology, v. 13, p. 659–675.
- Zhang, R. Y., and Liou, J. G., 1994, Coesite-bearing eclogite in Henan province, central China: Detailed petrography, glaucophane stability and PT-path: European Journal of Mineralogy, v. 6, p. 217–233.
- Zhang, R. Y., Liou, J. G., and Cong, B., 1995b, Talc-, magnesite- and Ti-clinohumite-bearing ultrahigh-pressure meta-mafic and ultramafic complex in the Dabie Mountains: Journal of Petrology, v. 36, p. 1011–1037.
- Zhang, R. Y., Liou, J. G., Ernst, W. G., Coleman, R. G., Sobolev, N. V., and Shatsky, V. S., 1997, Metamorphic evolution of diamond-bearing and associated rocks from the Kokchetav massif, northern Kazakhstan: Journal of Metamorphic Geology, v. 15, p. 479–496.